

The Scientific Consensus On When Life Begins

SOURCES THAT ESTABLISH
THE CONSENSUS VIEW
THAT A HUMAN'S LIFE
BEGINS AT FERTILIZATION

Table of Contents

I.	Definitions	Page 2
II.	Science Articles	Page 3
III.	Articles	Page 14
IV.	Science Books	Page 14
V.	Books	Page 19
VI.	Hearings and Events	Page 20
VII.	Additional Sources	Page 22
VIII	.1,061 Institutions Represented in Study on When Life Begins	Page 24

I. Definitions

- 1. "'Fertilization' is the process of union of two gametes (i.e., ovum and sperm) whereby the somatic chromosome number is restored and the development of a new individual is initiated"
 - Definitions used by U.S. National Institute of Health, Medline Plus, and Merriam-Webster Medical Dictionary, 2013¹
- 2. "Embryo: The developing individual between the union of the germ cells and the completion of the organs which characterize its body when it becomes a separate organism. . . . At the moment the sperm cell of the human male meets the ovum of the female and the union results in a fertilized ovum (zygote), a new life has begun. . . . The term embryo covers the several stages of early development from conception to the ninth or tenth week of life"
 - Definition of "Embryo" in Medical Embryology and Van Nostrand's Scientific Encyclopedia²
- 3. "Embryo: An organism in the earliest stage of development; is a man, from the time of conception to the end of the second month in the uterus"
 - Definition of "Embryo" in the Harper Collins Illustrated Medical Dictionary³
- 4. "Zygote. This cell results from the union of an oocyte and a sperm during fertilization. A zygote is the beginning of a new human being (i.e., an embryo). . . . [The zygote] marked the beginning of each of us as a unique individual"
 - o Definition of "Zygote" in The Developing Human: Clinically Oriented Embryology 4
- 5. "Zygote. This cell, formed by the union of an ovum and a sperm (Gr. zyg tos, yoked together), represents the beginning of a human being. The common expression 'fertilized ovum' refers to the zygote"

² Langman, J., *Medical Embryology*, 3rd ed., Baltimore: Williams and Wilkins, 1975, p. 3; Considine, D. (Ed.), *Van Nostrand's Scientific Encyclopedia*, 5th ed., New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1976, p. 943. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

¹ Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

³ Harper Collins Illustrated Medical Dictionary, New York: Harper Perennial, 1993, p. 146. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁴ Moore, K.L. & Persaud, T.V.N., *The Developing Human: Clinically Oriented Embryology*, 7th ed., Philadelphia: Saunders, 2003, pp. 2, 16. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

- Definition of "Zygote" in Before We Are Born: Essentials of Embryology and Birth Defects⁵
- 6. "Embryo: The early developing fertilized egg that is growing into another individual of the species. In man the term 'embryo' is usually restricted to the period of development from fertilization until the end of the eighth week of pregnancy"
 - o Definition of "Embryo" in Test-Tube Babies⁶
- 7. "Note on the meaning of scientific terminology for human development: "Organism" is the scientific name for a *living human being*. Only organisms undergo development. "Zygote" is the one-cell human organism produced by sperm-egg fusion. "Embryo" is a human organism during the first eight weeks of development"
 - Definitions of "Organism", "Zygote", and "Embryo" in The Origin of Human Life at Fertilization: Quotes Compiled from Medical Textbooks and Peer-Reviewed Scientific Literature?

II. Science Articles

- 8. "Fertilization is the union of gametes to *initiate development of a new* individual"
 - o Advances in Experimental Medicine and Biology Journal Article⁸
- 9. "Fertilization-the fusion of gametes to *produce a new organism*-is the culmination of a multitude of intricately regulated cellular processes"
 - o Advances in Experimental Medicine and Biology Journal Article9

⁵ Moore, K.L. & Persaud, T.V.N., *Before We Are Born: Essentials of Embryology and Birth Defects*, 4th ed., Philadelphia: W.B. Saunders, 1993, p. 1. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁶ Walters, W. & Singer, P. [Eds.], *Test-Tube Babies*, Melbourne: Oxford University Press, 1982, p. 160. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁷ Condic, M.L. *The Origin of Human Life at Fertilization: Quotes Compiled from Medical Textbooks and Peer-Reviewed Scientific Literature*, Bioethics Defense Fund, Last updated Nov. 2017, http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁸ Machaty, Z., Miller, A.R., & Zhang, L., *Egg Activation at Fertilization*, Adv Exp Med Biol, 2017, 953:1-47. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁹ Marcello, M.R., Singaravelu, G., & Singson, A., *Fertilization*, Adv Exp Med Biol, 2013, 757:321-50. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

- 10. "In multicellular organisms the fusion of two gametes with a haploid set of chromosomes leads to the formation of the zygote, the first cell of the embryo"
 - o Advances in Experimental Medicine and Biology Journal Article¹⁰
- 11. "The oocyte-to-embryo transition refers to the process whereby a fully grown, relatively quiescent oocyte undergoes maturation, fertilization, and is converted into a developmentally active, mitotically dividing embryo, arguably one of the most dramatic transitions in biology"
 - o Advances in Experimental Medicine and Biology Journal Article¹¹
- 12. "In higher animals, the *beginning of new life* and transfer of genetic material to the next generation occurs in the oviduct when two distinct gametes cells unite resulting in the formation of a zygote."
 - o Animal Reproduction Science Journal Article¹²
- 13. "A crucial step of fertilization is the sperm-egg interaction that allows the *two* gametes to fuse and create the zygote"
 - o Annual Review of Physiology Journal Article¹³
- 14. "At the end of oogenesis and spermatogenesis, both haploid gametes contain a single set of chromosomes ready to form the zygote, the first cell of the newly developing individual"
 - o Basic and Clinical Andrology Journal Article¹⁴
- 15. "We have discovered that a single sperm protein, phospholipase C-zeta (PLCζ), can stimulate intracellular Ca(2+) signalling in the unfertilized oocyte ('egg') culminating in the initiation of embryonic development. Upon fertilization by a

content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

¹⁰ El Yakoubi, W. & Wassmann, K., *Meiotic Divisions: No Place for Gender Equality*, Adv Exp Med Biol, 2017, 1002:1-17. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

¹¹ Robertson, S. & Lin, R., *The oocyte-to-embryo transition*, Adv Exp Med Biol, 2013, 757:351-72. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

¹² Salilew-Wondim, D., Schellander, K., Hoelker, M., & Tesfaye, D., Oviductal, endometrial and embryonic gene expression patterns as molecular clues for pregnancy establishment, Anim Reprod Sci, 2012, 134(1-2):9-18. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

¹³ Evans, J.P., Sperm-egg interaction, Annu Rev Physiol. 2012, 74:477-502. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

¹⁴ Gat, I. & Orvieto, R. "This is where it all started" - the pivotal role of PLCζ within the sophisticated process of mammalian reproduction: a systemic review, Basic Clin Androl, 2017, 21:27:9. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-

spermatozoon, the earliest observed signalling event in the dormant egg is a large, transient increase in free Ca(2+) concentration. The fertilized egg responds to the intracellular Ca(2+) rise by completing meiosis"

o Bioessays Journal Article¹⁵

16. "The traditional Western ethic has always placed great emphasis on the intrinsic worth and equal value of every human life regardless of its stage or condition. This ethic has had the blessing of the Judeo-Christian heritage and has been the basis for most of our laws and much of our social policy. The reverence for each and every human life has also been a keystone of Western medicine and is the ethic which has caused physicians to try to preserve, protect, repair, prolong and enhance every human life which comes under their surveillance. This traditional ethic is still clearly dominant, but there is much to suggest that it is being eroded at its core and may eventually even be abandoned. This of course will produce profound changes in Western medicine and in Western society. There are certain new facts and social realities which are becoming recognized, are widely discussed in Western society and seem certain to undermine and transform this traditional ethic... What is not yet so clearly perceived is that in order to bring this about hard choices will have to be made with respect to what is to be preserved and strengthened and what is not, and that this will of necessity violate and ultimately destroy the traditional Western ethic with all that this portends. It will become necessary and acceptable to place relative rather than absolute values on such things as human lives, the use of scarce resources and the various elements which are to make up the quality of life or of living which is to be sought... The process of eroding the old ethic and substituting the new has already begun. It may be seen most clearly in changing attitudes toward human abortion. In defiance of the long held Western ethic of intrinsic and equal value for every human life regardless of its stage, condition or status, abortion is becoming accepted by society as moral, right and even necessary. It is worth noting that this shift in public attitude has affected the churches, the laws and public policy rather than the reverse. Since the old ethic has not yet been fully displaced it has been necessary to separate the idea of abortion from the idea of killing, which continues to be socially abhorrent. The result has been a curious avoidance of the scientific fact, which everyone really knows, that human life begins at conception and is continuous whether intra- or extra-uterine until death. The very considerable semantic gymnastics which are required to rationalize

¹⁵ Nomikos, M., Swann, K., & Lai, F.A., Starting a new life: sperm PLC-zeta mobilizes the Ca2+ signal that induces egg activation and embryo development: an essential phospholipase C with implications for male infertility, Bioessays, 2012 Feb;34(2):126-34, doi: 10.1002/bies.201100127, Epub 2011. https://thefetalposition.com/conception/

abortion as anything but taking a human life would be ludicrous if they were not often put forth under socially impeccable auspices. It is suggested that this schizophrenic sort of subterfuge is necessary because while a new ethic is being accepted the old one has not yet been rejected"

- o California Medicine (aka Western Journal of Medicine) 1971 Editorial¹⁶
- 17. "Recognition between sperm and the egg surface *marks the beginning of life* in all sexually reproducing organisms"
 - o Cell Journal Article¹⁷
- 18. "Pronuclear/zygotic stage is the very first stage of life"
 - o Cellular and Molecular Life Sciences Journal Article¹⁸
- 19. "The egg-to-embryo transition marks the initiation of multicellular organismal development and is mediated by a specialized Ca(2+) transient at fertilization"
 - o Cell Calcium Journal Article¹⁹
- 20."[F]ertilization is the process by which male and female haploid gametes (sperm and egg) unite to produce a genetically distinct individual"
 - o Cell Tissue Research Journal Article²⁰
- 21. "Ca2+ signaling plays a crucial role in virtually all cellular processes, from the *origin of new life at fertilization* to the end of life when cells die"

¹⁶ "A New Ethic for Medicine and Society", Editorial, California Medicine 113, September 1970, pp. 67-68. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

¹⁷ Raj, I., Sadat, A.l., Hosseini, H., Dioguardi, E., Nishimura, K., Han, L., Villa, A., de Sanctis, D., & Jovine, L., *Structural Basis of Egg Coat-Sperm Recognition at Fertilization*, Cell, 2017, 169(7):1315-1326.e17. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

¹⁸ Okada, Y. & Yamaguchi, K., *Epigenetic modifications and reprogramming in paternal pronucleus: sperm, preimplantation embryo, and beyond*, Cell Mol Life Sci, 2017, 74(11):1957-1967. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

¹⁹ Nader, N., Kulkarni, R.P., Dib, M., & Machaca K. *How to make a good egg!: The need for remodeling of oocyte Ca(2+) signaling to mediate the egg-to-embryo transition*, Cell Calcium, 2013, 53(1):41-54. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

²⁰ Signorelli, J., Diaz, E.S., & Morales, P., *Kinases, phosphatases and proteases during sperm capacitation*, Cell Tissue Res. 349(3):765, 2012. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

- o Cellular and Molecular Life Sciences Journal Article²¹
- 22. "Mammalian embryo development begins when the fertilizing sperm triggers a series of elevations in the oocyte's intracellular free Ca(2+) concentration"
 - o Cell Tissue Research Journal Article²²
- 23. "The fusion of sperm and egg membranes initiates the life of a sexually reproducing organism"; "Membrane fusion has an overarching influence on living organisms. The fusion of sperm and egg membranes initiates the life of a sexually reproducing organism."
 - Chemical Society Reviews Journal Article²³
- 24. "It is intuitive that *fertilization-the start of life*-involves communication between a sperm cell and an egg"
 - o Communicative & Integrative Biology Journal Article²⁴
- 25. "Mammalian life, with all its complexity comes from a humble beginning of a single fertilized egg cell"
 - Current Opinion in Genetics & Development Journal Article²⁵
- 26. "Activation of the egg by the sperm is the first, vital stage of embryogenesis"

 Development Journal Article²⁶

21 Santella, L., Ercolano, E., Nusco, G.A., *The cell cycle: a new entry in the field of Ca2+ signaling*, Cell Mol Life Sci. 2005. 62(21):2405-13. Cited by:

http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

²² Machaty, Z., Signal transduction in mammalian oocytes during fertilization, Cell Tissue Res. 2016. 363(1):169-83. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

²³ Marsden, H.R., Tomatsu, I., & Kros, A., *Model systems for membrane fusion, Chem. Soc. Rev.* 40(3):1572, 2011. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf and https://thefetalposition.com/conception/.

²⁴ Asano, A., Nelson-Harrington, J.L., Travis, A.J., *Membrane rafts regulate phospholipase B activation in murine sperm*, Commun Integr Biol, 2013, 6(6):e27362. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

²⁵ Leung, C.Y. & Zernicka-Goetz, M. Mapping the journey from totipotency to lineage specification in the mouse embryo, Curr Opin Genet Dev, 2015, 34:71-6. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

²⁶ Hachem, A., Godwin, J., Ruas, M., Lee, H.C., Ferrer Buitrago, M., Ardestani, G., Bassett, A., Fox, S., Navarrete, F., de Sutter, P., Heindryckx, B., Fissore, R., & Parrington J., PLCζ is the physiological trigger of the Ca2+ oscillations that induce embryogenesis in mammals but conception can occur in its absence, Development,

- 27. "New parents anticipate their job begins at birth. Little do they know they have been exerting control within the baby's first cell since fertilization"
 - o Genetics Journal Article²⁷
- 28. "Since a new individual is derived from the fusion of a single sperm and egg, we tested..."
 - o Journal of Assisted Reproduction and Genetics Journal Article²⁸
- 29. "Fertilization is a complex process comprised of numerous steps. During fertilization, two highly specialized and differentiated cells (sperm and egg) fuse and subsequently trigger the *development of an embryo* from a quiescent, arrested oocyte"
 - Journal of Biochemistry and Molecular Biology Journal Article²⁹
- 30. "Oocyte maturation is an essential cellular differentiation pathway that prepares the egg for activation at fertilization leading to the *initiation of embryogenesis*"
 - o Journal of Cellular Physiology Journal Article³⁰
- 31. "In sexual organisms, division of the zygote initiates a new life cycle"
 - o Journal of Integrative Plant Biology Journal Article³¹
- 32. "The time of our conception is when we are most vulnerable to survival and growing as a healthy human being"

²⁷ Chu, D., *Parental Control Begins at the Beginning*, Genetics, 2016, 204(4):1377-1378. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

^{2017, 144(16):2914-2924.} Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

²⁸ Wilding, M., Coppola, G., De Icco, F., Arenare, L., Di Matteo, L., & Dale, B., *Maternal non-Mendelian inheritance of a reduced lifespan? A hypothesis*, J Assist Reprod Genet, 2014, 31(6):637-43. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

²⁹ Marcello, M.R. & Singson, A., Fertilization and the oocyte-to-embryo transition in C. elegans, BMB Rep, 2010, 43(6):389-99. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

³⁰ Machaca, K., Ca2+ signaling differentiation during oocyte maturation, J Cell Physiol, 2007, 213(2):331-40. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

³¹ Yang, K.J., Guo, L., Hou, X.L., Gong, H.Q., & Liu, C.M., ZYGOTE-ARREST 3 that encodes the tRNA ligase is essential for zygote division in Arabidopsis, J Integr Plant Biol, 2017, 59(9):680-692. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

- o Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology Journal Article³²
- 33. "Fertilization is the process that *leads to the formation of a diploid zygote* from two haploid gametes"
 - o Mammalian Genome Journal Article³³
- 34. "As representatives of the 60 trillion cells that make a human body, a sperm and an egg meet, recognize each other, and fuse to *create a new generation*"
 - o Methods in Molecular Biology Journal Article³⁴
- 35. "Mammalian life begins with a cell-cell fusion event, i.e. the fusion of the spermatozoid with the oocyte"
 - o Methods in Molecular Biology Journal Article³⁵
- 36. "Sperm are remarkably complex cells with a singularly important mission: to deliver paternal DNA and its associated factors to the oocyte *to start a new life*"
 - o Molecular Cell Proteomics Journal Article³⁶
- 37. "In mammals, egg activation is initiated by multiple cytosolic Ca(2+) transients (Ca(2+) oscillations) that are triggered following delivery of a putative sperm factor from the fertilizing sperm. The identity of this 'sperm factor' thus holds much significance, not only as a vital component in creating a new life, but also for its potential therapeutic and diagnostic value in human infertility"

³² Norman, R.J. & Aust, N.Z., 2015 RANZCOG Arthur Wilson Memorial Oration 'From little things, big things grow: The importance of periconception medicine', J Obstet Gynaecol. 2015. 55(6):535-40. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

³³ Lorenzetti, D., Poirier, C., Zhao, M., Overbeek, P.A., Harrison, W., & Bishop, C.E., A transgenic insertion on mouse chromosome 17 inactivates a novel immunoglobulin superfamily gene potentially involved in sperm-egg fusion, Mamm Genome, 2014, 25(3-4):141-8. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

³⁴ Inoue, N. & Okabe, M., *Sperm-egg fusion assay in mammals*, Methods Mol Biol, 2008, 475:335-45. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

³⁵ Willkomm, L. & Bloch, W. State of the art in cell-cell fusion, Methods Mol Biol. 2015, 1313:1. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

³⁶ Wu, T.F. & Chu, D.S., Sperm chromatin: fertile grounds for proteomic discovery of clinical tools, Mol Cell Proteomics, 2008, 7(10):1876-86. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

- o Molecular Human Reproduction Journal Article³⁷
- 38. "Aging is a developmental process that begins with fertilization and ends up with death involving a lot of environmental and genetic factors"
 - Molecular Neurobiology Journal Article³⁸
- 39. "The seminal question in modern developmental biology is *the origins of new life* arising from the unification of sperm and egg"
 - o Molecular Reproductive Development Journal Article³⁹
- 40. "When sperm meets egg: the spark of new life"
 - o Molecular Reproductive Development Journal Article⁴⁰
- 41. "Our data suggest that activation of LINE- 1 regulates global chromatin accessibility at the beginning of development and indicate that retrotransposon activation is integral to the developmental program"
 - o Nature Genetics Journal Article⁴¹
- 42. "The life cycle of mammals begins when a sperm enters an egg."
 - o Nature Journal Article⁴²

³⁷ Kashir, J., Nomikos, M., Swann, K., & Lai, F.A., *PLCζ or PAWP: revisiting the putative mammalian sperm factor that triggers egg activation and embryogenesis*, Mol Hum Reprod, 2015, 21(5):383-8. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

³⁸ Ahmed, M.S., Ikram, S., Bibi, N., & Mir, A. *Hutchinson-Gilford Progeria Syndrome: A Premature Aging Disease*, Mol Neurobiol. 2017. doi: 10.1007/s12035-017-0610-7. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

³⁹ Evsikov, A.V. & Marin de Evsikova, C., Gene expression during the oocyte-to-embryo transition in mammals, Mol Reprod Dev. 2009. 76(9):805-18. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf. ⁴⁰ Wozniak, K.L., Luque, G.M., & Ahn, S.H., When sperm meets egg: the spark of new life, Mol Reprod Dev. 2017. doi: 10.1002/mrd.22857. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf. ⁴¹ Jachowicz, J.W., Bing, X., Pontabry, J., Bosković, A., Rando, O.J., Torres-Padilla, M.E., LINE-1 activation after fertilization regulates global chromatin accessibility in the early mouse embryo, Nat Genet, 2017, 49(10):1502-1510, [referring to events in the zygote]. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁴² Okada, Y., Yamagata, K., Hong, K., Wakayama, T. & Zhang, I., *A role for the elongator complex in zygotic paternal genome demethylation*, NATURE, 463(7280):554-8, 2010. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

- 43. "Representing the 60 trillion cells that build a human body, a sperm and an egg meet, recognize each other, and *fuse to form a new generation of life*"
 - o Nature Journal Article⁴³
- 44. "Fertilization occurs when sperm and egg recognize each other and fuse to form a new, genetically distinct organism"
 - o Nature Journal Article⁴⁴
- 45. "When mammalian eggs and sperm come into contact in the female oviduct, a series of steps is set in motion that can lead to fertilization and ultimately to development of new individuals"; "Fertilization is defined as the process of union of two gametes, eggs and sperm. When mammalian eggs and sperm come into contact in the female oviduct, a series of steps is set in motion that can lead to fertilization and ultimately to development of new individuals"
 - o Natural Cell Biology Journal Article⁴⁵
- 46. "[Since I've been directly involved in over 60,000 abortions, I have] increasing certainty that I had in fact presided over 60,000 deaths"
 - New England Journal of Medicine Journal Article⁴⁶
- 47. "Fertilization is the culminating event in sexual reproduction and requires the recognition and fusion of the haploid sperm and egg to form a new diploid organism"
 - Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences Journal Article⁴⁷

⁴³ Inoue, N., Ikawa, M., Isotani, A., & Okabe, M., *The immunoglobulin superfamily protein Izumo is required for sperm to fuse with eggs*, Nature, 2005, 434(7030):234-8. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

 ⁴⁴ Bianchi, E., Doe, B., Goulding, D., & Wright, G.J., Juno is the egg Izumo receptor and is essential for mammalian fertilization, Nature, 2014, 508(7497):483-7. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.
 ⁴⁵ Wassarman, P.M., Jovine, L, Litscher, E.S., A profile of fertilization in mammals. Nat Cell Biol. 2001.3(2):E59-64. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf and https://thefetalposition.com/conception.

⁴⁶ Nathanson, B., *Deeper Into Abortion*, *New England Journal of Medicine* 291, 1974, 1189D90. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁴⁷ Bianchi, E. & Wright, G.J., Cross-species fertilization: the hamster egg receptor, Juno, binds the human sperm ligand, Izumo1, Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci,

- 48. "A proper dialogue between spermatozoa and the egg is essential for conception of a new individual in sexually reproducing animals. Ca(2+) is crucial in orchestrating this unique event *leading to a new life*"
 - o Physiological Reviews Journal Article⁴⁸
- 49. "Fertilization is a process involving multiple steps that lead to the final fusion of one sperm and oocyte to *form the zygote*"
 - o Protein & Cell Journal Article⁴⁹
- 50. "Human life begins with sperm and oocyte fusion"
 - o Reproduction Journal Article⁵⁰
- 51. "The oviduct or Fallopian tube is the anatomical region where every new life begins in mammalian species. After a long journey, the spermatozoa meet the oocyte in the specific site of the oviduct named ampulla, and fertilization takes place."
 - o Reproduction Journal Article⁵¹
- 52. "In sexually reproducing organisms, embryogenesis begins with the fusion of two haploid gametes"
 - o Reproductive Biology and Endocrinology Journal Article⁵²

^{2015, 370(1661):20140101.} Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁴⁸ Darszon A., Nishigaki, T., Beltran, C., & Treviño, C.L., *Calcium channels in the development, maturation, and function of spermatozoa*, Physiol Rev. 2011, 91(4):1305-55. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁴⁹ Sun, T.T., Chung, C.M., & Chan, H.C. *Acrosome reaction in the cumulus oophorus revisited: involvement of a novel sperm-released factor NYD-SP8*, Protein Cell, 2011, 2(2):92-8. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

<sup>Soygur, B. & Sati, L., The role of syncytins in human reproduction and reproductive organ cancers, Reproduction, 2016, 152(5):R167-78. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.
Coy, P., Garcia-Vazquez, F.A., Visconti, P.E., & Aviles, M. Roles of the oviduct in mammalian fertilization, Reproduction 144(6):649, 2012. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.
Tscherner, A., Gilchrist, G., Smith, N., Blondin, P., Gillis, D., & LaMarre, J., MicroRNA-34 family expression in bovine gametes and preimplantation embryos, Reprod Biol Endocrinol, 2014, 12:85. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.</sup>

- 53. "Fertilization is the sum of the cellular mechanisms that pass the genome from one generation to the next and *initiate development of a new organism*"
 - Science Journal Article⁵³
- 54. "At fertilization, eggs unite with sperm to initiate developmental programs that give rise to development of the embryo. Defining the molecular mechanism of this fundamental process at the beginning of life has been a key question in cell and developmental biology"
 - o Seminars in Cell and Developmental Biology Journal Article⁵⁴
- 55. "At the time of fertilization, an increase in the intracellular Ca(2+) concentration ([Ca(2+)](i)) underlies egg activation and initiation of development in all species studied to date"
 - o The Journal of Cellular Physiology Journal Article⁵⁵
- 56. "As the start of a new life cycle, activation of the first division of the zygote is a critical event in both plants and animals"
 - o The Plant Journal Journal Article⁵⁶
- 57. "The fusion of a sperm with an oocyte to form new life is a highly regulated event"
 - Theriogenology Journal Article⁵⁷
- 58. "Most readers of this review originated from a sperm-egg fusion event"

⁵³ Primakoff, P. & Myles, D.G. Penetration, adhesion, and fusion in mammalian sperm-egg interaction. Science. 2002. 296(5576):2183-5. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf. ⁵⁴ Sato, K., Fukami, Y., & Stith, B.J., Signal transduction pathways leading to Ca2+ release in a vertebrate model system: lessons from Xenopus eggs, Semin Cell Dev Biol, 2006. 17(2):285-92. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wpcontent/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf. ⁵⁵ Wakai, T., Vanderheyden, V., Yoon, S.Y., Cheon, B., Zhang, N., Parys, J.B., & Fissore, R.A., Regulation of inositol 1,4,5-trisphosphate receptor function during

mouse oocyte maturation, J Cell Physiol, 2012, 227(2):705-17. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf. ⁵⁶ Guo, L., Jiang, L., Zhang, Y., Lu, X.L., Xie, Q., Weijers, D., & Liu, C.M., The anaphase-promoting complex initiates zygote division in Arabidopsis through degradation of cyclin B1, Plant J, 2016, 86(2):161-74. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-

content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁵⁷ Gadella, B.M. & Boerke, A., An update on post-ejaculatory remodeling of the sperm surface before mammalian fertilization, Theriogenology, 2015, 85(1):113-24. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

III. Articles

- 59. "When fertilization is complete, a unique genetic human entity exists"
 - o Mayo Clinic Ethicist Dr. Christopher Hook, M.D.⁵⁹
- 60. "Life begins with fertilization and abortion is legalized destruction of life... We tell her exactly how it is . . . when they abort, they'll be aborting a small baby"
 - o Abortion Doctor Dr. Arthur Morris, Jr. 60
- 61. "When a human being begins to exist as a single-cell organism is an essential and relevant scientific fact of life that everyone can and should know, because there is a simple, well-established answer. For 75 years the field of human embryology (the branch of biology that specializes in the beginning of human life and early development) has documented when a human life begins in the Carnegie Stages of Early Human Embryonic Development and the Carnegie Chart"
 - o Science Educator Brooke Stanton⁶¹

IV. Science Books

- 62."[T]he evidence no longer allows a discussion as to if and when and in what month of ontogenesis a human being is formed. To be a human being is decided for an organism at the moment of fertilization of the ovum. For this reason we have to regard the intrinsic quality of the fertilized ovum as an essential prerequisite, decisive for all future ontogenesis".
 - o German anatomist and embryologist Dr. Erich Blechschmidt, M.D.⁶²
- 63. "[T]he fertilized egg (zygote) is the beginning of a new diploid individual."

⁵⁸ Oren-Suissa, M. & Podbilewicz, B., *Cell fusion during development*, Trends Cell Biol, 2007, 17(11):537-46, Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁵⁹ Hook, C. Mayo Clinic, as quoted by Richard Ostling in an AP news story, 9.24.99. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

 $^{^{60}}$ Asheville Citizen-Times, April 4, 1976. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgibin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁶¹ Stanton, B., *Science tells us when life begins. Why isn't it taught in the class room?*, Washington Examiner, 2018, https://www.washingtonexaminer.com/science-tells-us-when-life-begins-why-isnt-it-taught-in-the-classroom.

⁶² Blechschmidt, E. *Beginnings of Human Life*, New York, Heidelberg, and Berlin: Springer Verlag, 1977. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

- o Biology Professor Dr. Richard E. Jones, Ph.D.⁶³
- 64. "Human development begins at fertilization when an oocyte (ovum) from a female is fertilized by a sperm (spermatozoon) from a male... Embryology is concerned with the origin and development of a human being from a zygote to birth"
 - o Medical School Professor Dr. Keith L Moore, Ph.D., D.Sc. 64
- 65. "Human development begins at fertilization, when a sperm fuses with an oocyte to form a single cell, the zygote. This highly specialized, *totipotent cell* (capable of giving rise to any cell type) marks *the beginning of each of us as a unique individual.*"
 - o Medical School Professor Dr. Keith L Moore, Ph.D., D.Sc. 65
- 66. "The main results of fertilization are as follows: Restoration of the diploid number of chromosomes, half from the father half from the mother. Hence, the zygote contains a new combination of chromosomes different from both parents. Determination of the sex of the new individual. An X-carrying sperm produces a female (XX) embryo and a Y-carrying sperm produces a male (XY) embryo. Therefore, the chromosomal sex of the embryo is determined at fertilization"
 - o Embryologist Dr. T.W. Sadler, Ph.D.⁶⁶
- 67. "All of us were once human embryos, so the study of human embryology is the study of our own prenatal origins and experiences." (p. 2); "Fertilization, the uniting of egg and sperm, takes place in the oviduct. After the oocyte finishes meiosis, the paternal and maternal chromosomes come together, resulting in the formation of a zygote containing a single diploid nucleus. Embryonic development is considered to begin at this point." (p.14)

⁶³ Jones, R. E. *Human Reproductive Biology*, 4th edition. Waltham, MA. Elsevier, Academic Press, 2014, p. 169. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁶⁴ Moore, K.L. *Before We Are Born: Essentials of Embryology*, 9th edition. Philadelphia, PA: Saunders, 2016. p. 1. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁶⁵ Keith L. Moore, *The Developing Human: Clinically Oriented Embryology*, 10th edition. Philadelphia, PA: Saunders, 2016. p. 11. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁶⁶ Sadler, T.W. *Langman's Medical Embryology*, 13th edition. Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins, 2015. p. 42 (*emphasis added*). Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

- Medical School Professor Dr. Gary C. Schoenwolf, Ph.D. 67
- 68."[T]he evidence no longer allows a discussion as to if and when and in what month of ontogenesis a human being is formed. To be a human being is decided for an organism at the moment of fertilization of the ovum. For this reason we have to regard the intrinsic quality of the fertilized ovum as an essential prerequisite, decisive for all future ontogenesis".
 - o German anatomist and embryologist Dr. Erich Blechschmidt, M.D.⁶⁸
- 69. "Today it is known that the early stages of human development are strikingly different from the early developmental stages of all other species. . . . Ontogeny is phenogenesis. We talk of human development not because a jumble of cells, which is perhaps initially atypical, gradually turns more and more into a human, but rather because the human being develops from a uniquely human cell. There is no stage in human development prior to which one could claim that a being exists with not-yet-human individuality. On the basis of anatomical studies, we know today that no development phase exists that constitutes a transition from the not-yet-human to the human. . . In short, a fertilized human egg (conceptus) is already a human being. . . . The following important statement is valid: that which changes during development is only the phenotype but not the essence"
 - o German anatomist and embryologist Dr. Erich Blechschmidt, M.D.⁶⁹
- 70. "Almost all higher animals start their lives from a single cell, the fertilized ovum (zygote). . . . The time of fertilization represents the starting point in the life history, or ontogeny, of the individual"
 - o Embryologist and Biology Professor Dr. Bruce M. Carlson, M.D., Ph.D.⁷⁰
- 71. "No physician can say with certainty: if this pregnancy is not terminated promptly, the mother will die or her health be seriously impaired. On the other

⁶⁷ Schoenwolf, G. C. *Larsen's Human Embryology*, 5th edition. Philadelphia, PA: Elsevier, Saunders, 2015. p. 2, 14. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁶⁸ Blechschmidt, E. *Beginnings of Human Life*, New York, Heidelberg, and Berlin: Springer Verlag, 1977. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁶⁹ Blechschmidt, E. & Freeman, B (Ed.), *The Ontogenic Basis of Human Anatomy: A Biodynamic Approach to Development from Conception to Birth*, Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic, 2004. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgibin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁷⁰ Carlson, B.M., *Patten's Foundations of Embryology*, 6th ed. (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1996, p. 3. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

hand, he cannot say with certainty: if this pregnancy is terminated promptly by abortion, the mother will live. A physician has a clear duty to preserve human life, but by what principle can one demonstrate that he is the arbiter of life and death and can therefore decide to kill one human being in order that another may live? [All doctors (except abortionists) feel that the principles of the sanctity of human life held since the time of the ancient Jews and Hippocrates and stubbornly defended by the Catholic Church are correct, and we are pained when placed before the necessity of sacrificing it. At the present time, when rivers of blood and tears of innocent men, women and children are flowing in most parts of the world, it seems almost silly to be contending over the right to live of an unknowable atom of human flesh in the uterus of a woman. No, it is not silly. On the contrary, it is of transcendent importance that there be in this chaotic world one high spot, however small, which is safe against the deluge of immorality and savagery that is sweeping over us. That we, the medical profession, hold to the principle of the sacredness of human life and the rights of the individual, even though unborn, is proof that humanity is not yet lost and that we may ultimately attain salvation. - ed.]"

- o Dr. Joseph B. DeLee, M.D. & Dr. J.P. Greenhill, M.D.⁷¹
- 72. "Sexual reproduction occurs when female and male gametes (oocyte and spermatozoon, respectively) *unite at fertilization*."
 - o Medical School Professor Dr. Ronald W. Dudek, Ph.D.⁷²
- 73. "Development of the embryo begins at Stage 1 when a sperm fertilizes an oocyte and together they form a zygote"
 - o Medical School Professor Dr. Marjorie A. England⁷³
- 74. "The zygote thus formed represents the beginning of a new life"
 - o Dr. J.P. Greenhill, M.D. & Dr. Emanuel A. Friedman, M.D., DMedSci⁷⁴
- 75. "The basic fact is simple: life begins not at birth, but conception"

⁷¹ DeLee, J.B. & Greenhill, J.P. (Eds.), *1940 Yearbook of Obstetrics and Gynecology*, Chicago: Yearbook, 1941, pp. 68, 69. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgibin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁷² Dudek, R.W. *Embryology*, 4th edition. Philadelphia, PA. Lippincott Williams and Wilkins, 2008, p. 1. Cited by: http://bdfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Condic-Sources-Embryology.pdf.

⁷³ England, M.A., in *Life Before Birth*, 2nd ed., London: Mosby-Wolfe, 1996, p. 31. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁷⁴ Greenhill, J.P. & Friedman, E.A., *Biological Principles and Modern Practice of Obstetrics*, Philadelphia: W.B. Saunders, 1974, p. 17. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

- o Harvard University Geneticist Dr. Ashley Montagu, Ph.D.⁷⁵
- 76. "Human development begins after the union of male and female gametes or germ cells during a process known as fertilization. . . . Fertilization is a sequence of events that begins with the contact of a sperm (spermatozoon) with a secondary oocyte (ovum) and ends with the fusion of their pronuclei (the haploid nuclei of the sperm and ovum) and the mingling of their chromosomes to form a new cell. This fertilized ovum, known as a zygote, is a large diploid cell that is the beginning, or primordium, of a human being"
 - o Medical School Professor Dr. Keith L Moore, Ph.D., D.Sc.⁷⁶
- 77. "It is the penetration of the ovum by a spermatazoan and resultant mingling of the nuclear material that constitutes the culmination of the process of fertilization and marks the initiation of the life of a new individual"
 - o Embryologist and Medical School Professor Bradley M. Patten, Ph.D.⁷⁷
- 78. "Although life is a continuous process, fertilization... is a critical landmark because, under ordinary circumstances a new, genetically distinct human organism is formed when the chromosomes of the male and female pronuclei blend in the oocyte"
 - Medical School Professors Dr. Ronan O'Rahilly, M.D. & Dr. Fabiola Müller, M.D.⁷⁸
- 79. "The development of a human begins with fertilization, a process by which the spermatozoon from the male and the oocyte from the female unite to give rise to a new organism, the zygote"
 - o Embryologist Dr. T.W. Sadler, Ph.D.⁷⁹
- 80."[A]nimal biologists use the term embryo to describe the single cell stage, the two-cell stage, and all subsequent stages up until a time when recognizable humanlike limbs and facial features begin to appear between six to eight weeks

⁷⁵ Montagu, A. *Life Before Birth*, New York, Signet, 1977. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁷⁶ Moore, K.L., *Essentials of Human Embryology*, Toronto: B.C. Decker, 1988, p. 2. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁷⁷ Patten, B.M., *Human Embryology*, 3rd ed., New York: McGraw-Hill, 1968, p. 43. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁷⁸ O'Rahilly, R. & Muller, F. *Human Embryology and Teratology*, 3rd ed., New York: Wiley-Liss, 2001, p. 8. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁷⁹ Sadler, T.W., *Langman's Medical Embryology*, 7th ed., Baltimore: Williams & Wilkins, 1995, p. 3. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

after fertilization..."; "[A] number of specialists working in the field of human reproduction have suggested that we stop using the word embryo to describe the developing entity that exists for the first two weeks after fertilization. In its place, they proposed the term pre-embryo..."; "I'll let you in on a secret. The term pre-embryo has been embraced wholeheartedly by IVF practitioners for reasons that are political, not scientific. The new term is used to provide the illusion that there is something profoundly different between what we nonmedical biologists still call a six-day-old embryo and what we and everyone else call a sixteen-day-old embryo"; "The term pre-embryo is useful in the political arena -- where decisions are made about whether to allow early embryo (now called pre-embryo) experimentation -- as well as in the confines of a doctor's office, where it can be used to allay moral concerns that might be expressed by IVF patients. 'Don't worry,' a doctor might say, 'it's only pre-embryos that we're manipulating or freezing. They won't turn into real human embryos until after we've put them back into your body."

o Princeton University Professor Dr. Lee M. Silver, Ph.D.⁸⁰

V. Books

- 81. "Perhaps the most straightforward relation between you and me on the one hand and every human fetus from conception onward on the other is this: All are living members of the same species, homo sapiens. A human fetus, after all, is simply a human being at a very early stage in his or her development"
 - o Philosophy Professor David Boonin, Ph.D.81
- 82."A human fetus is not a nonhuman animal; it is a stage of human being"
 - o Philosophy Professor Wayne Sumner, Ph.D.82
- 83. "Modern technologies have convinced us that beyond question the unborn child is simply another human being, another member of the human community, indistinguishable in every way from any of us"
 - o Abortion Doctor Dr. Bernard Nathanson, M.D.⁸³

⁸⁰ Silver, L.M., *Remaking Eden: Cloning and Beyond in a Brave New World*, New York: Avon Books, 1997, p. 39. Cited by:

https://www.princeton.edu/~prolife/articles/embryoguotes2.html.

⁸¹ Boonin, D. *A Defense of Abortion*, New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002, p. 20. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁸² Sumner, W. *Abortion and Moral Theory*, Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1981, p. 10. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁸³ Bernard Nathanson, B. *Aborting America*, Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1979. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

- 84. "I accept what is biologically manifest, that human life commences at the time of conception"
 - o Obstetrician-Gynecologist Dr. Landrum Shettles⁸⁴

VI. Hearings and Events

- 85. "Physicians, biologists, and other scientists agree that conception marks the beginning of the life of a human being—a being that is alive and is a member of the human species. There is overwhelming agreement on this point in countless medical, biological, and scientific writings."
 - o The Official Senate report on Senate Bill 158 (the "Human Life Bill")85
- 86. "Pro-abortionists, though invited to do so, failed to produce even a single expert witness who would specifically testify that life begins at any point other than conception or implantation. Only one witness said no one can tell when life begins"
 - A prominent physician pointed out at 1981 Senate hearings on the "Human Life Bill" (S-158, 97th Congress, 1st Session, 1981)⁸⁶
- 87. "I have learned from my earliest medical education that human life begins at the time of conception. . . . I submit that human life is present throughout this entire sequence from conception to adulthood and that any interruption at any point throughout this time constitutes a termination of human life. . . . I am no more prepared to say that these early stages [of development in the womb] represent an incomplete human being than I would be to say that the child prior to the dramatic effects of puberty . . . is not a human being. This is human life at every stage"

⁸⁴ Shettles, L. *Rites of Life*, Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, p. 103. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁸⁵ S-158, 97th Congress, 1st Session, 1981; "Background on the Committee testifiers: A group of internationally-known biologists and geneticists appeared to speak on behalf of the scientific community on the subject of when a human being begins. They all presented the same view and there was no opposing testimony. Among those testifying: Dr. Micheline M. Mathews-Roth, Harvard medical School, Dr. Jerome Lejeune ("Father of Modern Genetics"), Dr. McCarthy de Mere, medical doctor and law professor, University of Tennessee, Dr. Alfred Bongiovanni, Professor of Pediatrics and Obstetrics, University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine, Dr. Richard V. Jaynes, Dr. Landrum Shettles, sometimes called the "Father of In Vitro Fertilization", Professor Eugene Diamond, Gordon, Hymie, M.D., F.R.C.P., Chairman of Medical Genetics, Mayo Clinic, Rochester" (https://www.facebook.com/notes/716620865136847/?__tn__=H-R).

⁸⁶ S-158, 97th Congress, 1st Session, 1981. https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604. exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

- Medical School Professor of Pediatrics and Obstetrics Dr. Alfred M. Bongiovanni, M.D.⁸⁷
- 88."[A]fter fertilization has taken place a new human being has come into being . . . not a metaphysical contention, it is plain experimental evidence. . . . Each individual has a very neat beginning, at conception"; "The human nature of the human being from conception to old age is not a metaphysical contention, it is plain experimental evidence"
 - o Medical School Professor Dr. Jerome LeJeune, M.D.⁸⁸
- 89."By all the criteria of modern molecular biology, life is present from the moment of conception"
 - o Mayo Clinic Medical School Professor Dr. Hymie Gordon, M.D.⁸⁹
- 90. "It is incorrect to say that biological data cannot be decisive... It is scientifically correct to say that an individual human life begins at conception... Our laws, one function of which is to help preserve the lives of our people, should be based on accurate scientific data"
 - Harvard University Medical School Professor Micheline Matthews-Roth⁹⁰
- 91. "The beginning of a single human life is from a biological point of view a simple and straightforward matter, the beginning is conception. This straightforward biological fact should not be distorted to serve sociological, political, or economic goals"
 - o Medical School Professor Dr. Watson A. Bowes⁹¹
- 92."[A]bortion terminates the life of a unique, whole, living human being"
 - Conclusion of Report of The South Dakota Task Force to Study Abortion⁹²

⁸⁷ S-158, 97th Congress, 1st Session, 1981. https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604. exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁸⁸ S-158, 97th Congress, 1st Session, 1981. https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604. exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁸⁹ S-158, 97th Congress, 1st Session, 1981. https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁹⁰ S-158, 97th Congress, 1st Session, 1981. https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604. exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁹¹ S-158, 97th Congress, 1st Session, 1981. https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604. exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

⁹² Report of The South Dakota Task Force to Study Abortion, Submitted to the Governor and Legislature of South Dakota, p. 13, 2005. https://www.dakotavoice.com/Docs/South%20

- 93. "The changes occurring between implantation, a six-week embryo, a six-month fetus, a one-week-old child, or a mature adult are merely stages of development and maturation. The majority of our group could find no point in time between the union of sperm and egg, or at least the blastocyst stage, and the birth of the infant at which point we could say that this was not a human life"
 - o Conclusion from the First International Symposium on Abortion⁹³

VII. Additional Sources

- 1. Berry, S., Study: 96% of 5,577 Biologists Affirm Human Life Begins at Fertilization, Breitbart, July 11, 2019, https://www.breitbart.com/politics/2019/07/11/study-96-of-5577-biologists-affirm-human-life-begins-at-fertilization.
- 2. Condic, M.L. When Does Human Life Begin? The Scientific Evidence and Terminology Revisited, 8 U. ST. THOMAS J.L. & PUB. POLY 44-81, 2013, http://www.embryodefense.org/MaureenCondicSET.pdf.
- 3. Hammer, J., *HAMMER: A World-Renowned University Suppressed Important Abortion Research. Here's The Full Story*, Daily Wire, July 2, 2019, https://www.dailywire.com/news/hammer-world-renowned-university-suppressed-josh-hammer.
- 4. House Resolution No. 214, https://leg1.state.va.us/cgi-bin/legp504.exe?151+ful +HR214+pdf.
- 5. Irving, D.N. What Human Embryo?: Funniest Mental Gymnastics from Medicine and Research, Catholic Culture, https://www.catholicculture.org/culture/library/view.cfm?recnum=6373.
- 6. Jacobs, S., Biologists' Consensus on 'When Life Begins' (July 25, 2018). Available at SSRN: https://ssrn.com/abstract=3211703.
- 7. Jacobs, S., *I Asked Thousands of Biologists When Life Begins. The Answer Wasn't Popular*, Quillette, October 16, 2019, https://quillette.com/2019/10/16/i-asked-thousands-of-biologists-when-life-begins-the-answer-wasnt-popular.
- 8. Jacobs, S.A. Balancing Abortion Rights and Fetal Rights: A Mixed Methods Mediation of the U.S. Abortion Debate, KNOWLEDGE@UCHICAGO, 2019, https://knowledge.uchicago.edu/record/1883.

Dakota%20Abortion%20Task%20Force%20Report.pdf.

⁹³ Abortion Questions and Answers, Cincinnati, OH: Hayes, 1988, p. 42. Cited by: https://lis.virginia.gov/cgi-bin/legp604.exe?161+ful+HR19+pdf.

- 9. Life *Begins at Fertilization*, Princeton University, https://www.princeton.edu/~prolife/articles/embryoquotes2.html.
- 10. Life Begins at Fertilization Peer Reviewed Scientific Sources, The Fetal Position, May 29, 2019, https://thefetalposition.com/conception.
- 11. Smith, D. Pro-Choice Concedes: Prominent Abortion Proponents Concede The Barbarity Of Abortion, HUMAN DEFENSE INITIATIVE, November 7, 2018, https://humandefense.com/prochoice-concedes.
- 12. The Carnegie Stages of Human Embryonic Development, Contend Projects, https://contendprojects.org/the-science/carnegie-stages
- 13. The Science of the Unborn, Pro-Life Atheists, October 20, 2015, https://www.facebook.com/notes/716620865136847/?__tn__=H-R.

VIII. 1,061 Institutions Represented in Study on When Life Begins

These are the academic institutions of the biologists who affirmed that a human's life begins at fertilization in the recent international study on when a human's life begins.

Aarhus University	Denmark
Abilene Christian University	USA
Adelphi University	USA
Agnes Scott College	USA
Aix-Marseille University	France
Alabama State University	USA
Albert Ludwigs University of Freiburg	Germany
Albion College	USA
Alcorn State University	USA
Allegheny College	USA
Alma College	USA
Alma Mater Studiorum - University of Bologna	Italy
American Museum of Natural History	USA
American University	USA
Amherst College	USA
Anderson University	USA
Angelo State University	USA
Appalachian State University	USA
Arcadia University	USA
Aristotle University of Thessaloniki	Greece
Arizona Christian University	USA
Arizona State University	USA
Arkansas State University	USA
Arkansas Tech University	USA
Armstrong State University	USA
Ashland University	USA
Assumption College	USA
Auburn University	USA
Augsburg College	USA
Augusta University	USA
Augustana College	USA
Austin College	USA
Australian National University	Australia
Ave Maria University	USA

Azusa Pacific University	USA
Babson College	USA
Baldwin Wallace University	USA
Ball State University	USA
Bangor University	USA
Bard College	USA
Barnard College	USA
Barrow Neurological Institute	USA
Barry University	USA
Barton College	USA
	USA
Bates College Pay Both College	USA
Bay Path College	USA
Belmont Abbey College	
Belmont University	USA
Beloit College	USA
Ben Gurion University of the Negev	Israel
Bennington College	USA
Berea College	USA
Bethel College	USA
Bethel University	USA
Bethune-Cookman University	USA
Biola University	USA
Birkbeck, University of London	England
Birmingham-Southern College	USA
Bismarck State College	USA
Black Hills State University	USA
Blackburn College	USA
Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania	USA
Bluffton University	USA
Boehringer Ingelheim	Germany
Boise State University	USA
Boston College	USA
Boston College of Medicine	USA
Boston University	USA
Bowie State University	USA
Bowling Green State University	USA
Bradley University	USA
Brandeis University	USA
Brenau University	USA
Bridgewater College	USA

USA Bridgewater State University Brigham Young University USA Brigham Young University - Idaho USA Brooklyn College USA Brookyln College USA Brown University USA Bryan College USA Bryn Mawr College **USA Bucknell University** USA Buena Vista University USA **Buffalo State** USA Cal Poly USA California Institute of Technology USA California Lutheran University USA California Maritime Academy USA California State University USA USA Calvin College Cameron University USA **USA** Campbell University Canisius College USA Capital University USA Cardiff University USA Carleton College USA Carnegie Mellon University USA Carson-Newman College USA Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies USA Case Western Reserve University USA Catholic University USA Cedar Crest College USA USA Central College **USA** Central Michigan University Central South University China Central Washington University USA Centre College USA Chalmers University of Technology Sweden Chaminade University of Honolulu USA Champlain College USA Chapman University USA

Czech Republic

USA

Charles University

Charleston Southern University

USA Chatham University Chestnut Hill College USA Chicago Botanic Garden USA Chicago State University USA Chico State University USA China Medical University Taiwan Chinese University of Hong Kong Hong Kong Chowan University USA Christian Albrechts University zu Kiel Germany Christian Brothers University USA Christopher Newport University USA Chulalongkorn University Thailand USA Citadel Military College City University of Hong Kong Hong Kong Clark University USA Clarkson University USA Clayton State University USA Clemson University USA Cleveland State University **USA** Coastal Carolina University USA Coe College USA Coker College USA USA Colby College Colgate University USA College at Brockport **USA** College of Charleston **USA** College of Idaho USA College of New Jersey **USA** College of St. Scholastica **USA** College of Staten Island USA **USA** College of the Atlantic College of William & Mary USA College of Wooster USA Colorado Christian University USA Colorado College USA Colorado Mesa University USA Colorado State University USA Columbia University USA

USA

USA

Columbus State University

Concordia College

Concordia University	USA
Connecticut College	USA
Converse College	USA
Cornell College	USA
Cornell University	USA
Covenant College	USA
Creighton University	USA
CUNY	USA
CUNY - Baruch College	USA
CUNY - Brooklyn College	USA
CUNY - CCNY	USA
CUNY - Graduate Center	USA
	USA
CUNY - Hunter College	
CUNY - Queens College	USA
CUNY - The Graduate Center	USA
CUNY - York College	USA
Curry College	USA
D'Youville College	USA
Daemen College	USA
Dalhousie University	Canada
Dartmouth College	USA
Davidson College	USA
Davis & Elkins College	USA
Deakin University	Australia
Delaware State University	USA
Delaware Valley College	USA
Delta State University	USA
Denison University	USA
DePaul University	USA
DePauw University	USA
DeSales University	USA
Desert Botanical Garden	USA
Dickinson College	USA
Dixie State University	USA
Doane College	USA
Dominican College	USA
Dominican University	USA
Drake University	USA
Drew University	USA
Drexel University	USA

Dublin City University Ireland USA **Duke University Duquesne University** USA **Durham University** England USA Earlham College USA East Stroudsburg University East Tennessee State University USA East Texas Baptist University **USA** Eastern Connecticut State University USA Eastern Illinois University **USA** Eastern Kentucky University USA Eastern Mennonite University USA **USA** Eastern Michigan University Eastern New Mexico University **USA** Eastern University USA Eberhard Karls Universitat Tubingen Germany USA Eckerd College Ecole Normale Superieure de Lyon France **Ecole Normale Superieure Paris** France Ecole Polytechnique Federale de Lausanne Switzerland

USA Edinboro University

Netherlands Eindhoven University of Technology

USA Elmhurst College Elmira College USA Elms College **USA USA** Emmanuel College **Emory University** USA Emporia State University USA **Endicott College** USA **Eotvos Lorand University** Hungary Erasmus University Rotterdam Netherlands

Eureka College USA Evergreen State College USA USA Fairfield University Fairleigh Dickinson University **USA** Field Museum USA Flinders University Australia Florida A&M University USA

Florida Atlantic University USA Florida Institute of Technology **USA**

USA Florida International University **USA** Florida State University Fordham University USA Fort Hays State University USA Fort Lewis College USA Fort Valley State University USA Framingham State University USA Francis Marion University USA Franklin and Marshall College USA Fredonia USA Freie Universitaet Berlin Germany Fresno Pacific University USA Fresno State University USA Friedrich-Alexander-Universitat Erlangen Nurnberg Germany Furman University USA Gallaudet University USA Gannon University USA Genome Institute of Singapore Singapore USA George Fox University George Mason University **USA** George Washington University USA Georgetown University USA **USA** Georgia College Georgia Institute of Technology USA Georgia Southern University **USA USA** Georgia Southwestern State University Georgia State University USA Georgia Tech University USA Georgian Court University USA USA Gettysburg College Ghent University Belgium Gonzaga University USA Gordon College USA Goshen College USA Grace College USA Grambling State University USA Grand Valley State University USA Grand View University USA Great Basin College USA Green Mountain College **USA**

Griffith University	Australia
Grinnell College	USA
Guilford College	USA
Gustavus Adolphus College	USA
Gwynedd Mercy University	USA
Hampden-Sydney College	USA
Hampton University	USA
Harding University	USA
Hartwick College	USA
Harvard University	USA
Harvey Mudd College	USA
Haskell Indian Nations University	USA
Haverford College	USA
Hawaii Pacific University	USA
Hebrew University of Jerusalem	Israel
Heidelberg University	Germany
Henderson State University	USA
High Point University	USA
Hiram College	USA
Hobart & William Smith Colleges	USA
Hofstra University	USA
Hokkaido University	Japan
Hollins University	USA
Holy Cross	USA
Hong Kong University of Science and Technology	USA
Hood College	USA
Hope College	USA
Houston Baptist University	USA
Howard University	USA
Humboldt State University	USA
Humboldt-Universitat zu Berlin	Germany
Huntingdon College	USA
Idaho State University	USA
Illinois College	USA
Illinois Institute of Technology	USA
Illinois State University	USA
Imperial College London	England
Indian Institute of Technology Bombay	India
Indiana State University	USA
Indiana University - Bloomington	USA

Indiana University of Pennsylvania USA Indiana Wesleyan University USA Institut Pasteur France Institute of Bioorganic Chemistry Russia Institute of Molecular Biology - Boehringer Ingelheim Foundation Germany **USA** Iowa State University **IPFW** USA Ithaca College USA **IUPUI USA** Jackson State University USA Jacksonville State University USA Jagiellonian University Poland James Madison University USA Jawaharlal Nehru University India Jefferson USA Johannes Gutenberg Universitat Mainz Germany John Brown University USA Johns Hopkins University USA Judson University USA Julius Maximillians Universitat Wurzburg Germany Juniata College USA **USA** Kansas State University Germany Karlsruhe Institute of Technology Karolinska Institutet Sweden Kean University USA Keene State College USA Kennesaw State University USA **USA** Kent State University Kentucky State University USA

King Abdullah University of Science and Technology Saudi Arabia

USA

Kentucky Wesleyan College

King University
USA
King's College London
England
Knox College
USA
Kobe University
Japan

Korea University

KU Leuven

Kutztown University

Kyoto University

South Korea

Belgium

USA

Japan

Kyushu University Japan **USA** La Roche College La Salle University USA La Trobe University Australia USA Lafayette College USA LaGrange College Lake Erie College USA Lake Superior State University **USA** Lancaster University England Lander University **USA** Laval University Canada Le Moyne College USA USA Lee University Lees-McRae College USA Lehigh University USA Lehman College USA

Leiden University Netherlands

Lenoir-Rhyne University USA USA Lewis & Clark College Lewis University USA Liberty University USA Lincoln Park Zoo USA Lincoln University USA Linkoping University Sweden Loma Linda University USA Lomonosov Moscow State University Russia London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine England Long Island University USA Longwood University USA USA Loras College USA USA

Louisiana State University Louisiana State University - Baton Rouge Louisiana Tech University USA USA Loyola Marymount University Loyola University - Chicago USA Loyola University Maryland USA Loyola University New Orleans USA Lubbock Christian University USA Ludwig-Maximilian University of Munich Germany

Lund University Sweden

USA Luther College USA Lynchburg College Lynn University USA

Maastricht University Netherlands

Macalester College USA

Macquarie University Australia Mahidol University Thailand Malone University USA Manchester University USA Manhattan College USA Marist College USA Marlboro College USA Marquette University USA Mars Hill University USA

Marshall University USA Martin Luther University of Halle-Wittenberg Germany

Marywood University USA

Masaryk University Czech Republic

Massachusetts Institute of Technology USA

New Zealand Massey University

USA McDaniel College Canada McGill University Canada McMaster University McMurry University USA McNeese State University USA Medical University of Graz Austria Memorial University of Newfoundland Canada Mercer University USA

Meredith College USA Messiah College USA Miami University **USA** Michigan State University USA Michigan Technological University USA Middle Tennessee State University USA Millersville University USA Millikin University USA Millsaps College USA Minnesota State University USA

USA Minot State University Misericordia University **USA**

Mississippi College	USA
Mississippi College Mississippi State University	USA
· · ·	USA
Mississippi University for Women Missouri Botanical Garden	USA
	USA
Missouri State University	
Missouri State University	USA
Missouri University of Science and Technology	USA
Missouri Western State University Moffitt Cancer Center	USA
	USA
Molloy College Managh University	USA Augtoralia
Monash University	Australia
Montana State University	USA
Montana Tech	USA
Montclair State University	USA
Monterey Peninsula College	USA
Moravian College	USA
Morningside College	USA
Mount Holyoke College	USA
Mount Saint Mary College	USA
Mount St. Joseph University	USA
Mount St. Mary's College	USA
Mount St. Mary's University	USA
Muhlenberg College	USA
Murdoch University	Australia
Murray State University	USA
Museum fur Naturkunde Berlin	Germany
Nagoya University	Japan
Nanyang Technological University, Singapore	Singapore
National and Kapodistrian University of Athens	Greece
National Chiao Tung University	Taiwan
National Taiwan University	Taiwan
National University of Ireland Galway	Ireland
National University of Singapore	Singapore
National Yang Ming University	Taiwan
Nazareth College	USA
NC A&T	USA
Neumann University	USA
Nevada State College	USA
New College of Florida	USA
New Jersey City University	USA

New Jersey Institute of Technology	USA
New Mexico Highlands University	USA
New Mexico State University	USA
New Mexico Tech	USA
New Paltz	USA
New York University	USA
Newcastle University	England
Newman University	USA
Niagara University	USA
Nicholls State University	USA
Norfolk State University	USA
North Carolina Central University	USA
North Carolina State University	USA
North Central College	USA
North Dakota State University	USA
North Greenville University	USA
North Park University	USA
Northeastern Illinois University	USA
Northeastern State University	USA
Northeastern University	USA
Northern Arizona University	USA
Northern Illinois University	USA
Northern Kentucky University	USA
Northern Michigan University	USA
Northern New Mexico University	USA
Northwest Missouri State University	USA
Northwest Nazarene University	USA
Northwestern College	USA
Northwestern University	USA
Norwegian University of Science and Technology	Norway
Notre Dame of Maryland University	USA
Notre Dame University	USA
NYC College of Technology	USA
Oakland University	USA
Oberlin College	USA
Occidental College	USA
Ohio State University	USA
Ohio University	USA
Ohio Wesleyan University	USA
Oklahoma Christian University	USA

USA Oklahoma State University USA Old Dominion University Olivet Nazarene University USA Oral Roberts University USA Oregon State University USA Oregon Zoo USA Osaka University Japan Oxford Brookes University England Pacific Lutheran University USA Pacific University USA Peking University China Penn State University **USA** Pennsylvania State University - University Park USA Pepperdine University USA Philadelphia University USA Philander Smith College USA Philipps Universitat Marburg Germany Plymouth State University USA Point Loma Nazarene University **USA** Pomona College USA Chile Pontificia Universidad Catolica de Chile Portland State University USA

POSTECH South Korea

Princeton University
USA
Principia College
USA
Providence College
USA
Purdue University
USA
Purdue University - West Lafayette
USA

Pusan National University

Queen Mary University of London

Queen's University at Kingston

Queen's University Belfast

Queensland University of Technology

Quincy University

Quincy University

USA

Quinnipiac University

USA

Radboud University Netherlands

Radford University
USA
Ramapo College of New Jersey
USA
Randolph College
USA
Randolph-Macon College
USA

Reed College	USA
Regis University	USA
Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute	USA
Rheinische Friedrich-Wilhelms-Universitat Bonn	Germany
Rhodes College	USA
Rice University	USA
Rider University	USA
Ripon College	USA
Rivier College	USA
Roberts Wesleyan College	USA
Rochester Institute of Technology	USA
Rockefeller University	USA
Rockford College	USA
Rocky Mountain College	USA
Rogers State University	USA
Roosevelt University	USA
Rose-Hulman Institute of Technology	USA
Rowan College	USA
Rowan University	USA
Royal Holloway	England
Ruprecht-Karls-Universitat Heidelberg	Germany
Rush University Medical Center	USA
Russell Sage College	USA
Rutgers	USA
Rutgers University	USA
Rutgers University - New Brunswick	USA
Rutgers University - Newark	USA
RWTH Aachen University	Germany
Sacramento State	USA
Saginaw Valley State University	USA
Saint Anselm College	USA
Saint Augustine's University	USA
Saint John's University	USA
Saint Joseph's College of Maine	USA
Saint Joseph's University	USA
Saint Louis University	USA
Saint Martin's University	USA
Saint Mary's College of California	USA
Saint Mary's University of Minnesota	USA
Saint Michael's College	USA

C : (D) (C 11	TICA
Saint Peter's College	USA
Saint Petersburg State University	Russia
Saint Xavier University	USA
Salem College	USA
Salve Regina University	USA
Samford University	USA
San Diego State University	USA
San Jose State University	USA
Sapienza University of Rome	Italy
Seattle Pacific University	USA
Seattle University	USA
Seton Hall University	USA
Seton Hill University	USA
Shanghai Jiao Tong University	China
Shemyakin-Ovchinnikov Institute	Russia
Shenandoah University	USA
Shepherd University	USA
Shippensburg University	USA
Siena College	USA
Simmons College	USA
Simon Fraser University	Canada
Simpson College	USA
Skidmore College	USA
Slippery Rock University	USA
Smith College	USA
Sonoma State University	USA
South Dakota State University	USA
Southeastern Louisiana University	USA
Southern Nazarene University	USA
Southern Oregon University	USA
Southern Utah University	USA
Southern Wesleyan University	USA
Southwestern Oklahoma State University	USA
Southwestern University	USA
Spelman College	USA
Spring Hill College	USA
Springfield College	USA
St. Ambrose University	USA
St. Andrews University	USA
St. Bonaventure University	USA
Do. Dolla vollulate Chirotolog	0011

USA St. Catherine University USA St. Cloud State University St. Edward's University USA St. Francis College USA USA St. John Fisher College USA St. John's University St. Joseph's College USA St. Lawrence University **USA** St. Louis University USA St. Mary's College USA St. Norbert College USA St. Olaf College USA Stanford University USA Stellenbosch University South Africa Stephen F. Austin State University USA Stevens Institute of Technology USA Stevenson University USA Stockholm University Sweden **USA** Stockton University Suffolk University USA Sungkyunkwan University South Korea SUNY - Binghamton University USA SUNY - Cortland **USA** SUNY - Geneseo USA SUNY - Oneonta **USA** SUNY - Oswego **USA** SUNY - Plattsburgh USA SUNY - Potsdam USA SUNY - Purchase **USA** SUNY - Stony Brook University USA USA SUNY - University at Albany SUNY - University at Buffalo USA Susquehanna University USA Swarthmore College USA

Tarleton State University USA
Technical University of Denmark
Denmark

Sweet Briar College

Syracuse University

Taipei Medical University

Tabor College

USA

USA

USA

Taiwan

Technical University of Munich Germany Technion Israel Institute of Technology Israel Technische Universitat Darmstadt Germany Technische Universität Dresden Germany Tel Aviv University Israel Temple University USA Texas A&M University - College Station USA Texas A&M University - Corpus Christi USA Texas A&M University - Kingsville USA Texas Christian University **USA** Texas Tech University USA Texas Woman's University USA Thomas Jefferson University **USA** Thomas More College **USA** Tiffin University USA Tokyo Institute of Technology Japan Touro College USA Towson University USA **USA** Translyvania University Trinity College **USA** Trinity College - Dublin Ireland USA Trinity University Trinity Washington University USA Truman State University USA Tsinghua University China **Tufts University** USA **Tulane University** USA U.S. Geological Survey USA UC Merced **USA** Umea University Sweden **UMES USA UNC** Charlotte USA **UNC** Pembroke USA Union College USA Union University USA UNIST - Korea South Korea

Universite libre de Bruxelles
Universidad Autonoma de Madrid
Universidad de Buenos Aires
Universidad de Chile
South Role
Belgium
Spain
Argentina
Chile

Universidad de Sevilla Spain Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico Mexico Universidad San Francisco de Quito Ecuador Universidade de Sao Paulo Brazil Universita degli Studi di Pavia Italy Universita di Padova Italy Universitat Autonoma de Barcelona Spain Universitat Bielefeld Germany Universitat de Barcelona Spain Universitat Duisburg-Essen Germany Universitat Frankfurt am Main Germany Universitat Hamburg Germany Universitat Jena Germany Universitat Leibzig Germany Universitat Pompeu Fabra Spain Universitat Potsdam Germany Universitat Regensburg Germany Universitat Stuttgart Germany Universite catholique de Louvain Belgium Universite Claude Bernard Lyon 1 France France Universite de Montpellier Universite de Montreal Canada Universite de Sherbrooke Canada Universite de Strasbourg France Universite Grenoble-Alpes France Universite Laval Canada Universite Nice Sophia Antipolis France Universite Paris-Sud France Universite Pierre et Marie Curie France Universiti Malaya Malaysia Universiti Sains Malaysia Malaysia Universiti Teknologi Malaysia Malaysia University College Cork Ireland University College Dublin Ireland University College London England University Complutense Madrid Spain University North Carolina - Greensboro USA University of Aberdeen Scotland University of Adelaide Scotland University of Akron **USA**

USA University of Alabama University of Alabama - Birmingham **USA** University of Alabama - Huntsville USA University of Alaska USA University of Alaska Fairbanks USA University of Alberta Canada University of Amsterdam Netherlands University of Antwerp Belgium University of Arizona USA University of Arkansas **USA** University of Arkansas - Monticello USA University of Auckland New Zealand University of Baltimore USA University of Bari Italy University of Basel Switzerland University of Bayreuth Germany

University of Bergen Norway University of Bern Switzerland United Kingdom University of Birmingham

University of Bologna Italy University of Bordeaux France University of Bristol England Canada University of British Columbia University of Calgary Canada University of California - Berkeley **USA USA** University of California - Davis

University of California - Irvine USA University of California - Los Angeles USA University of California - Riverside **USA** USA University of California - San Diego **USA** University of California - San Francisco University of California - Santa Barbara USA University of California - Santa Cruz USA University of Cambridge England New Zealand University of Canterbury South Africa University of Cape Town

University of Central Arkansas USA University of Central Florida USA University of Central Missouri USA University of Chicago **USA**

China University of Chinese Academy of Sciences **USA** University of Cincinnati University of Cologne Germany University of Colorado - Boulder USA University of Colorado - Colorado Springs USA **USA** University of Colorado - Denver University of Connecticut USA University of Crete Greece University of Dallas USA University of Debrecen Hungary University of Delaware USA University of Denver USA University of Dubuque **USA** University of Dundee Scotland University of Dusseldorf Germany University of East Anglia England University of Edinburgh Scotland University of Erlangen-Nuremberg Germany University of Evansville **USA** University of Exeter England University of Findlay USA University of Florence Italy University of Florida **USA** University of Geneva Switzerland University of Georgia USA Scotland University of Glasgow Sweden University of Gothenburg University of Gottingen Germany University of Granada Spain University of Groningen Netherlands University of Guelph Canada University of Hartford USA University of Hawaii USA University of Hawaii - Hilo USA

USA

USA

India

USA

USA

Finland

University of Hawaii - Manoa

University of Illinois - Chicago

University of Helsinki

University of Houston

University of Idaho

University of Hyderabad

USA University of Illinois - Springfield University of Illinois - Urbana-Champaign **USA** University of Indianapolis USA University of Iowa USA University of Jamestown USA USA University of Kansas University of Kentucky USA University of KwaZulu-Natal South Africa University of Lausanne Switzerland University of Leeds England University of Leicester England University of Lisbon Portugal University of Liverpool England University of Louisiana **USA** University of Louisiana - Lafayette USA University of Louisiana - Monroe USA University of Louisville **USA** University of Maine USA **USA** University of Maine at Augusta University of Maine at Machias **USA** University of Manchester England University of Manitoba Canada University of Marburg Germany University of Mary Hardin-Baylor USA University of Mary Washington **USA** University of Maryland USA University of Maryland - Baltimore County USA University of Maryland - College Park **USA** University of Massachusetts USA USA University of Massachusetts - Amherst **USA** University of Massachusetts - Boston University of Massachusetts - Lowell USA University of Melbourne Australia USA University of Memphis University of Miami USA University of Michigan - Ann Arbor USA University of Michigan - Dearborn USA University of Michigan - Flint USA

Italy

Portugal

University of Milan

University of Minho

USA University of Minnesota - Duluth **USA** University of Minnesota - Morris University of Minnesota - Twin Cities USA University of Missouri USA University of Missouri - Kansas City USA University of Missouri - St. Louis USA University of Montana **USA** University of Montevallo **USA** University of Mount Union USA University of Munster Germany University of Naples - Federico II Italy University of Nebraska - Lincoln USA University of Nebraska - Omaha USA University of Nevada - Las Vegas USA University of Nevada - Reno USA University of New Hampshire **USA** University of New Haven **USA** University of New Mexico USA **USA** University of New Orleans University of Newcastle England University of North Carolina - Asheville USA University of North Carolina - Chapel Hill USA University of North Carolina - Charlotte USA University of North Carolina - Greensboro USA University of North Carolina - Wilmington USA University of North Dakota USA University of North Florida USA University of North Georgia **USA** University of Northern Colorado **USA** USA University of Northern Iowa University of Notre Dame **USA** University of Nottingham United Kingdom University of Oklahoma USA USA University of Oregon University of Oslo Norway University of Otago New Zealand University of Ottawa Canada University of Oulu Finland University of Oxford England

USA

University of Pennsylvania

University of Pisa Italy USA University of Pittsburgh University of Porto Portugal University of Pretoria South Africa University of Puerto Rico Puerto Rico University of Puerto Rico - Rio Piedras Puerto Rico University of Queensland Australia University of Reading England University of Redlands USA University of Rhode Island **USA** University of Richmond USA University of San Diego USA University of San Francisco **USA** University of Saskatchewan Canada University of Scranton USA University of Sheffield England University of South Alabama USA University of South Australia Australia USA University of South Carolina University of South Dakota **USA** University of South Florida USA University of Southampton England USA University of Southern California University of Southern Denmark Denmark University of Southern Indiana **USA USA** University of Southern Maine University of Southern Mississippi USA University of St. Francis USA University of St. Thomas **USA** University of Sussex England University of Sydney Australia University of Tasmania Australia University of Technology Sydney Australia University of Temple USA University of Tennessee - Chattanooga USA University of Tennessee - Knoxville USA University of Tennessee - Martin USA University of Texas - Austin USA University of Texas - Dallas USA University of Texas - El Paso **USA**

University of Texas - San Antonio
USA
University of the Pacific
USA
University of the Sciences
USA

University of the Witwatersrand South Africa

University of Tokyo Japan University of Toronto Canada University of Tromso Norway University of Tsukuba Japan University of Tubingen Germany University of Turin Italy University of Turku Finland University of Utah USA University of Vermont **USA** University of Vienna Austria University of Virginia USA University of Warsaw Poland University of Warwick England University of Washington USA University of Waterloo Canada University of West Alabama **USA**

University of West Georgia
University of Western Australia
Australia
University of Western Ontario
Canada
University of Wisconsin - Green Bay
USA

University of Wisconsin - La Crosse
University of Wisconsin - Madison
University of Wisconsin - Milwaukee
University of Wisconsin - Oshkosh
University of Wisconsin - Platteville
University of Wisconsin - Stevens Point
University of Wisconsin - Whitewater
USA

University of Wisconsin - Whitewater
University of Wollongong
University of Wurzburg
University of Wyoming
University of York
University of Zurich
University Ulm

USA

Australia

Germany

Germany

Switzerland

Germany

Germany

Uppsala University Sweden UQAC Canada UQAM Canada

UQAR Canada
UQTR Canada
Utah State University USA
Utah Valley University USA
Utica College USA

Utrecht University Netherlands

UW BothellUSAValdosta State UniversityUSAValparaiso UniversityUSAVassar CollegeUSA

Victoria University of Wellington New Zealand

Villanova University USA Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University **USA** Virginia Tech **USA** Virginia Wesleyan College USA Wagner College USA Wake Forest University USA Warner Pacific College USA Wartburg College **USA** Washburn University USA Washington & Jefferson College USA Washington College USA USA Washington State University Washington University in St. Louis USA

Wayne State University USA Weber State University USA Webster University USA Weizmann Institute of Science Israel Wellcome Trust Sanger Institute England Wellesley College USA Wells College **USA** Wesleyan College USA Wesleyan University USA West Chester University USA West Virginia University USA Western Carolina University USA Western Illinois University USA

Western Oregon University USA

Western Kentucky University

Western New England University

USA

USA

Western State Colorado University USA Western Washington University USA Westfalische Wilhelms Universitat Munster Germany Westmont College USA Wheaton College USA Wheeling Jesuit University USA Whitman College USA Wichita State University USA Widener University USA Wilkes University USA Willamette University USA William Jewell College USA William Paterson University USA Williams College USA Winona State University USA Winthrop University USA Wisconsin Lutheran College USA Worcester Polytechnic Institute USA Wright State University USA Wuhan University China **Xavier University** USA Xi'an Jiaotong University China Yale University USA USA Yavapai College York College USA York University Canada Youngstown State University USA